

# Commission for Historical and Architectural Preservation

## Meeting Minutes

### June 12, 2018

The Public Hearing of the Commission for Historical and Architectural Preservation (CHAP) commenced at 1:07 on June 12, 2018.

1. **ROLL CALL** – This meeting was chaired by Tom Liebel. Roll was called and the following commissioners were in attendance:

	Present	Absent
Tom Liebel	x	
Donna Cypress		x
Robert Embry	x	
Aaron Bryant		x
Cynthia Conklin		x
Laura Penza	x	
John Bullock	x	
Larry Gibson	x	
Anath Ranon	x	
Matthew Mosca	x	
Jim French	x	
Elizabeth Nix	x	
Wendi Redfern-Curtis	x	

2. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR May 8, 2018**

Motion made by:	Bullock
Seconded by:	Penza
Commission Vote: Approve Minutes	

	For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom Liebel				
Donna Cypress				x
Robert Embry	x			
Aaron Bryant				x
Cynthia Conklin				x
Laura Penza	x			
John Bullock	x			
Larry Gibson	x			
Anath Ranon	x			
Matthew Mosca	x			
Jim French	x			
Elizabeth Nix	x			
Wendi Redfern-Curtis	x			
<b>Total</b>	9			3

**3. Consent Agenda**

Requests:	<p>Review and Respond to City Council Bills 18-0241 Urban Renewal - Druid Heights - Amendment, 18-0242 Urban Renewal - Broadway East - Amendment, 18-0243 Urban Renewal - Poppleton - Amendment, 18-0244 Urban Renewal - Oliver - Amendment, 18-0245 Urban Renewal - Park Heights - Amendment, 18-0246 Urban Renewal - Coldstream Homestead Montebello- Amendment, 18-0247 Urban Renewal - Johnston Square - Amendment, &amp; 18-0248 Urban Renewal - Middle East – Amendment</p> <p>Applicant: Council President  Staff Reviewer: Stacy Montgomery  Staff Recommendation: No Objection, Defer to Planning</p> <p>Rehabilitation of Building Including Adding a Deck and Changing a Window Opening to Door  Applicant: War Horse Cities, Owner; David R. Lopez, Architect  Staff Reviewer: Walter Gallas  Staff Recommendation: Approval</p>
Motion made by:	Gibson
Seconded by:	Ranon
Motion:	Approve consent agenda

		For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom	Liebel				
Donna	Cypress				x
Robert	Embry	x			
Aaron	Bryant				x
Cynthia	Conklin				x
Laura	Penza	x			
John	Bullock	x			
Larry	Gibson	x			
Anath	Ranon	x			
Matthew	Mosca	x			
Jim	French	x			
Elizabeth	Nix	x			
Wendi	Redfern-Curtis	x			
	<b>Total</b>	9			3

**4. 1000 West Lombard Street (Union Square Historic District)**

Request:	Rehearing - Retain Unapproved Exterior Work
Petitioner:	Sarbjit Singh, Owner
Staff Presenter:	Walter Gallas
Staff Recommendation:	Disapproval. See Staff Report.
Additional Speakers:	Abraham Hurdle, Dan Roddenberg, Srabjit Singh, Elizabeth Waters, Jane Bucharri
Motion made by:	Bullock
Seconded by:	Penza
Motion:	<p>Move Staff Recommendation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>CHAP staff recommends a finding of disapproval of the request to retain the exterior work performed without CHAP approval.</b></li> <li>• <b>The owner should work with staff to remove the unapproved alterations and make corrections that conform to the October 27, 2016, Authorization to Proceed.</b></li> <li>• <b>Staff recommends:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Retain window and door alignment at first floor</li> <li>○ Remove vinyl barrel awning with signage on the Lombard and Schroeder Street sides and replace with flat sign on Lombard Street side</li> <li>○ Remove hanging corner sign and supports</li> <li>○ Remove metal roll-down door at the front entry</li> <li>○ Rebuild concrete ramp to conform to approved plans</li> <li>○ Remove window on the Schroeder Street side</li> <li>○ Remove awning over door on the Schroeder Street side</li> <li>○ Remove blinking lights in windows</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

Tom  
Donna  
Robert

Liebel  
Cypress  
Embry

For	Against	Abstain	Absent
			x
x			

Aaron	Bryant				x
Cynthia	Conklin				x
Laura	Penza	x			
John	Bullock	x			
Larry	Gibson	x			
Anath	Ranon	x			
Matthew	Mosca	x			
Jim	French	x			
Elizabeth	Nix	x			
Wendi	Redfern-Curtis	x			
	<b>Total</b>	9			3

**5. 2320 Mayfield Avenue (Baltimore City Landmark)**

Request:	Install Telecommunications Equipment on Bell Tower
Petitioner:	Carlton Gilbert, T-Mobile; Maryland Boys Choir, Owner
Staff Presenter:	Lauren Schiszik
Staff Recommendation:	Disapproval. See Staff Report.
Additional Speakers:	Sean Hughes, Mohamed Osanna, Kamil (civil engineer), David Berg, Frank Cimino, Steven Holmes
Motion made by:	Gibson
Seconded by:	Nix
Motion:	Move staff recommendation:  Staff recommends a finding of disapproval of this proposal, as it does not comply with CHAP guidelines and would result in an installation that would alter the character-defining feature of the bell-tower.

		For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom	Liebel				
Donna	Cypress				x
Robert	Embry		x		
Aaron	Bryant				x
Cynthia	Conklin				x
Laura	Penza	x			

John	Bullock			x	
Larry	Gibson	x			
Anath	Ranon	x			
Matthew	Mosca		x		
Jim	French	x			
Elizabeth	Nix	x			
Wendi	Redfern-Curtis		x		
	<b>Total</b>	5	3	1	3

**6. 1 North Carey Street (Union Square Historic District)**

Request:	Concept Review - Construct Five-Story Addition
Petitioner:	1 N. Carey St. LLC, Owner; Phillip L. Scott, Architect
Staff Presenter:	Caitlin Audette
Staff Recommendation:	Concept Approval. See Staff Report.
Additional Speakers:	Phillip Scott, Michael Sieppe, Dan Roddenberg
Motion made by:	Ranon
Seconded by:	Penza
Motion:	<p>Approve staff recommendation with three amendments  Staff recommends approval of the mass and scale with final details to return to the full commission. Architect should explore alternative design options before returning to the full commission.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Space windows more evenly within the vertical plane, modifying the uppermost window to either be a tall window that responds to the lofted interior space (and resembles the double height window at the historic building), or a smaller window that helps create the cap to the building’s composition.</li> <li>• Revise the building’s cornice to better relate to the historic building.</li> <li>• Use double-hung windows rather than commercial sliding windows.</li> <li>• Building materials should be compatible with the historic red brick building, taking design cues from the building.</li> <li>• Remove the alternating brick colors. On a flat plane this styling is awkward. If the architect chose to create protruding bays, the use of an alternative material at this bay could be more appropriate. However, this would be a change to the massing</li> </ul>

	<p>that would need to be reviewed by the full commission. Additionally, a slightly recessed bay, similar to the historic building may give the appearance sought by the architect.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• At the side elevation the lintels and sills that extend from the stairwell windows should be removed.</li> <li>• Modify the first floor cornice to more be more compatible with the cornice visible at the historic building’s storefront.</li> <li>• Revise the storefront to be more compatible with the historic building.</li> </ul> <p>The amendments are the following:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. consider [and care for] the condition of the existing building,</li> <li>2. Consider a broader vision for the project [by looking into incorporating sites abutting the property; and</li> <li>3. the height of the addition shall not exceed height of cornice</li> </ol>
--	--

		For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom	Liebel				
Donna	Cypress				x
Robert	Embry	x			
Aaron	Bryant				x
Cynthia	Conklin				x
Laura	Penza	x			
John	Bullock	x			
Larry	Gibson	x			
Anath	Ranon	x			
Matthew	Mosca	x			
Jim	French	x			
Elizabeth	Nix	x			
Wendi	Redfern-Curtis	x			
	<b>Total</b>				

**7. 1208-1226 East Baltimore Street (Jonestown Historic District)**

Request:	Concept Review - Construct Seven-Story Building
Petitioner:	Helping Up Mission/House of Freedom
Staff Presenter:	Walter Gallas

Staff Recommendation:	Concept Approval. See Staff Report.
Additional Speakers:	Steve Gudeman, Jim Collimore
Motion made by:	Embry
Seconded by:	Mosca
Motion:	<p>Move staff recommendation with two amendments:  <b>RECOMMENDATION</b>  Staff recommends concept approval of height, scale, and massing, with plans to return to Commission for final approval of design details including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Window details - Staff recommends the applicant examine including the potential use of operable windows. Additionally, details that should be reviewed and provided to staff for review include the reflectivity of the glass, depth of window within masonry, and depth of muntin. The use of shadow as a design element is encouraged.</li> <li>• Masonry color – Clarification on what colors are used where on the building.</li> <li>• Cornice at second floor and roof edge at top of seventh floor</li> <li>• Belt course between sixth and seventh floors – Review the use of the belt course and perhaps add more depth and mass to the course.</li> <li>• Rooftop terrace setback and railing detail</li> <li>• Signage</li> </ul> <p>The amendments are the following:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. further explore the connection [of the building] with the playground, and</li> <li>2. consider height of buildings across the street.</li> </ol>

Tom  
Donna

Liebel  
Cypress

For	Against	Abstain	Absent
			x

Robert Embry	x			
Aaron Bryant				x
Cynthia Conklin				x
Laura Penza	x			
John Bullock	x			
Larry Gibson	x			
Anath Ranon	x			
Matthew Mosca	x			
Jim French	x			
Elizabeth Nix	x			
Wendi Redfern-Curtis	x			
<b>Total</b>	9			3

**8. 1326 Hollins Street – Building fronting on Booth Street (Union Square Historic District)**

Request:	Demolition Hearing I - Determination of Architectural
Petitioner:	JJI, LLC (Steven Troy)
Staff Presenter:	Walter Gallas
Staff Recommendation:	Building is Contributing. See Staff Report.
Additional Speakers:	Dan Roddenburg, Steven Troy
Motion made by:	Gibson
Seconded by:	Bullock
Motion:	Approve demolition because CHAP finds that the structure no longer contributes to the district. Investigate the deconstruction of the building in order to save the brick..

For	Against	Abstain	Absent
-----	---------	---------	--------



Tom	Liebel				
Donna	Cypress				X
Robert	Embry		X		
Aaron	Bryant				X
Cynthia	Conklin				X
Laura	Penza	X			
John	Bullock	X			
Larry	Gibson	X			
Anath	Ranon		X		
Matthew	Mosca			X	
Jim	French	X			
Elizabeth	Nix		X		
Wendi	Redfern-Curtis				X
	<b>Total</b>	4	3	1	4

**9. 1101, 1103, 1105 Hollins Street & 41, 43 South Arlington Avenue (Union Square Historic District)**

Request:	Concept Review - Construct Five New Three-Story Rowhouses
Petitioner:	War Horse Cities, Owner; Adam Carballo, Architect
Staff Presenter:	Walter Gallas
Staff Recommendation:	Concept Approval. See Staff Report.
Additional Speakers:	Adam Carballo, Jane Buchari, Elizabeth Waters.
Motion made by:	French
Seconded by:	Embry
Motion:	<p>Move Staff Recommendation:  Staff recommends concept approval of height, scale, and massing, with plans to return to Commission for final approval of design details. Staff recommends that the architect develop more fully:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Alignment of tops of doors, transoms and windows, with elimination of transoms above first floors</li> <li>• Relate cornices at top of bays to roof cornices</li> <li>• An alternative to casement windows, such as one-over-one windows, include more windows at end unit street elevations, and rework window-door placement at rear elevations.</li> <li>• Some modifications to facades, specific to 41, 43 S. Arlington Avenue plans, to relate more effectively to adjoining historic houses, such as lowering first floor slightly and/or removing</li> </ul>

	belt courses.
--	---------------

		For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom	Liebel				
Donna	Cypress				x
Robert	Embry	x			
Aaron	Bryant				x
Cynthia	Conklin				x
Laura	Penza	x			
John	Bullock	x			
Larry	Gibson	x			
Anath	Ranon	x			
Matthew	Mosca	x			
Jim	French	x			
Elizabeth	Nix	x			
Wendi	Redfern-Curtis				x
	<b>Total</b>	8			4

**10. 2001 Aliceanna Street (Fells Point Historic District)**

Request:	Final Review - Construct Addition to Existing Building
Petitioner:	Hord Coplan Macht, Architect
Staff Presenter:	Eddie Leon
Staff Recommendation:	Final Approval. See Staff Report.
Additional Speakers:	Chris Harvey, Sean Keffersten
Motion made by:	Embry
Seconded by:	Ranon

Motion:	<p>Move staff recommendation:</p> <p><b>RECOMMENDATION</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Approve Phase 1 with final details to be reviewed by staff.</b></li> <li>• <b>Note: approval is for the new addition to the existing warehouse, new rear residential addition and amenities structures located in Phase 1. Phase 2 will be reviewed by the commission at a future date.</b></li> </ul>
---------	---

		For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom	Liebel				
Donna	Cypress				x
Robert	Embry	x			
Aaron	Bryant				x
Cynthia	Conklin				x
Laura	Penza	x			
John	Bullock				x
Larry	Gibson	x			
Anath	Ranon	x			
Matthew	Mosca	x			
Jim	French	x			
Elizabeth	Nix	x			
Wendi	Redfern-Curtis				x
	<b>Total</b>	7			5

**11. 1709 Fleet Street (Fells Point Historic District)**

Request:	Demolition Hearing I - Determination of Architectural Significance
Petitioner:	Klein Enterprises
Staff Presenter:	Eddie Leon
Staff Recommendation:	Building is Contributing. See Staff Report.
Additional Speakers:	Andrew Freeman
Motion made by:	Ranon
Seconded by:	Embry

Motion:	Approve Staff recommendation that the “ <b>The building contributes to the Fell’s Point Historic District.”</b>
---------	--

		For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom	Liebel				
Donna	Cypress				x
Robert	Embry	x			
Aaron	Bryant				x
Cynthia	Conklin				x
Laura	Penza	x			
John	Bullock				x
Larry	Gibson	x			
Anath	Ranon	x			
Matthew	Mosca	x			
Jim	French	x			
Elizabeth	Nix	x			
Wendi	Redfern-Curtis				x
	<b>Total</b>	7			5

**12. 1419 Eutaw Place (Bolton Hill Historic District)**

Request:	Economic Hardship to allow for Installation of Vinyl Windows
Petitioner:	Johnathon Brett
Staff Presenter:	Lauren Schiszik
Staff Recommendation:	Table Item to Await More Information. See Staff Report.
Additional Speakers:	Jonathan Brett, Elizabeth Brett, Glenn Gates

Motion made by:	Gibson
Seconded by:	Penza
Motion:	<p>Approve staff recommendation with one amendment:</p> <p>Recommendation - Staff recommends that the Commission table their decision until the applicant returns to the Commission with two estimates for the following scope:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Replacement of the ten windows on Jordan Street with 1/1 windows that fully meet CHAP guidelines.</li> <li>• Replacement of the remaining windows on the side and rear elevations (including the dining room casement windows) with 1/1 replacement windows that more closely meet the typical framing and detail of the historic windows and which do not require vinyl or aluminum wrapping.</li> </ul> <p>Amendment: The proposed windows do not conform to the guidelines.</p>

		For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom	Liebel	x			
Donna	Cypress				x
Robert	Embry				x
Aaron	Bryant				x
Cynthia	Conklin				x
Laura	Penza	x			
John	Bullock				x
Larry	Gibson	x			
Anath	Ranon	x			
Matthew	Mosca	x			
Jim	French	x			
Elizabeth	Nix	x			
Wendi	Redfern-Curtis				x
	<b>Total</b>	7			6

**Meeting Adjourned – 6:28 PM**