

Commission for Historical and Architectural Preservation
Meeting Minutes
August 11, 2020

The Public Hearing of the Commission for Historical and Architectural Preservation (CHAP) commenced at 1:00 p.m. on May 12, 2020

1. **ROLL CALL** – This meeting was chaired by Tom Liebel. Roll was called and the following commissioners were in attendance:

	Present	Absent
Tom Liebel	x	
Ann Powell	x	
Aaron Bryant	x	
Jill Dennis	x	
Laura Penza	x	
John Bullock	x	
Larry Gibson	x	
Anath Ranon	x	
Matthew Mosca	x	
Jim French	x	
Elizabeth Nix		x
Kate Edwards		x
Monica Rhodes	x	

2. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR July 14, 2020**

Motion made by:	Ranon
Seconded by:	Bryant
Commission Vote: Approve	

	For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom Liebel	X			
Ann Powell	X			
Aaron Bryant	X			
Jill Dennis	X			
Laura Penza	X			
John Bullock	X			
Larry Gibson	X			
Anath Ranon	X			
Matthew Mosca	X			
Jim French	X			
Elizabeth Nix				x
Kate Edwards				X
Monica Rhodes	X			
Total	11			2

--	--	--	--

3. CC Bill 2020-0552 Tax credit renewal

Request:	Renewal legislation
Petitioner:	CC President
Staff Presenter:	Stacy
Staff Recommendation:	Approval
Additional Speakers:	Angelica Bailey
Motion made by:	Ranon
Seconded by:	Gibson
Motion:	Support

Tom	Liebel
Ann	Powell
Aaron	Bryant
Jill	Dennis
Laura	Penza
John	Bullock
Larry	Gibson
Anath	Ranon
Matthew	Mosca
Jim	French
Elizabeth	Nix
Kate	Edwards
Monica	Rhodes
	Total

For	Against	Abstain	Absent
x			
x			
x			
x			
x			
x			
			x
			x
X			
10			

4. 726 Colorado Avenue (Windhurst Historic District)

Request:	Request: Construct three-story house
Petitioner:	Jeffrey Ott
Staff Presenter:	Eddie Leon
Staff Recommendation:	Approval with Details and Final Plans to return to staff
Additional Speakers:	Jeffrey Ott, Karen Tong, Henry Kay, Heather Hairston
Motion made by:	Ranon
Seconded by:	Bryant
Motion:	Approval of final material and final drawings, and to incorporate neighborhood comments. And to simplify mullion pattern.

		For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom	Liebel				
Ann	Powell	x			
Aaron	Bryant	x			
Jill	Dennis	x			
Laura	Penza	x			
John	Bullock	x			
Larry	Gibson	x			
Anath	Ranon	x			
Matthew	Mosca	x			
Jim	French	x			
Elizabeth	Nix				
Kate	Edwards	x			
Monica	Rhodes	x			

Total

11			
----	--	--	--

5. 830 Park Avenue (Mount Vernon Historic District)

Request:	Concept Review – New Masonry Wall and Gates
Petitioner:	Miriam Ewers, Lynda Ewers, and Tim DeVoe
Staff Presenter:	Caitlin Audette
Staff Recommendation:	Staff recommends approval of the design with the condition that the curbcut approval is tied to the construction of the masonry wall.
Additional Speakers:	Miriam Devoe
Motion made by:	Bryant
Seconded by:	Gibson
Motion:	Approval of the design with the condition that the curbcut approval is tied to the construction of the masonry wall.

Tom Liebel
Ann Powell
Aaron Bryant
Jill Dennis
Laura Penza
John Bullock
Larry Gibson
Anath Ranon
Matthew Mosca
Jim French
Elizabeth Nix

For	Against	Abstain	Absent
x			
x			
x			
x			
x			
x			
x			
			x

Kate	Edwards	x			
Monica	Rhodes	x			
	Total	11			

6. 1809 West Forest Park Avenue (Franklinton historic district)

Request:	Hardship Request - Replace Vinyl Siding with Vinyl Siding
Petitioner:	Bernice Driggs, Owner
Staff Presenter:	Walter Gallas
Staff Recommendation:	Allow alternative to wood or cement board siding based on economic hardship
Additional Speakers:	Bernice Driggs
Motion made by:	Penza
Seconded by:	Bryant
Motion:	Approve staff recommendation: Allow alternative to wood or cement board siding based on economic hardship

		For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom	Liebel				
Ann	Powell	x			
Aaron	Bryant	x			
Jill	Dennis	x			
Laura	Penza	x			
John	Bullock	x			
Larry	Gibson	x			
Anath	Ranon	x			
Matthew	Mosca	x			
Jim	French	x			
Elizabeth	Nix				x
Kate	Edwards	x			
Monica	Rhodes	x			

Total

11			
----	--	--	--

7. 214 W Mulberry Street (Howard Street Commercial Historic District)

Request:	Hardship Request – Rehabilitation of front portion of historic building. Replace existing deteriorated roof with steel trellis.
Petitioner:	Park Avenue Partners LLC
Staff Presenter:	Stacy Montgomery
Staff Recommendation:	The proposed rehabilitation of the historic building does not meet Chapter 1 of the Historic Preservation Design Guidelines. The costs submitted by the applicant demonstrate that their plan to create an open patio is the only plan that meets their current project budget. Staff recommends disapproval of the proposal and that the applicant return with a plan to install a true roof and windows in all historic openings.
Additional Speakers:	Christopher Janian, Johns Hopkins, Lance Decker, Charles Alexander
Motion 1 made by:	Penza
Motion 1. Seconded by:	Mosca
Motion:	Approve applicant plans, minimize the streetview and return to staff. [FAILED)

		For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom	Liebel				
Ann	Powell		x		
Aaron	Bryant		x		
Jill	Dennis		x		
Laura	Penza	x			
John	Bullock				x
Larry	Gibson		x		

Anath	Ranon			x	
Matthew	Mosca	x			
Jim	French	x			
Elizabeth	Nix				x
Kate	Edwards	x			
Monica	Rhodes		x		
	Total	4	5		

	Motion #2
Staff Recommendation:	<p>The proposed rehabilitation of the historic building does not meet Chapter 1 of the Historic Preservation Design Guidelines. The costs submitted by the applicant demonstrate that their plan to create an open patio is the only plan that meets their current project budget.</p> <p>Staff recommends disapproval of the proposal and that the applicant return with a plan to install a true roof and windows in all historic openings.</p>
Additional Speakers:	
Motion 2 made by:	Gibson
Seconded by:	Powell
Motion:	<p>The proposed rehabilitation of the historic building does not meet Chapter 1 of the Historic Preservation Design Guidelines. The costs submitted by the applicant demonstrate that their plan to create an open patio is the only plan that meets their current project budget.</p> <p>Staff recommends disapproval of the proposal and that the applicant return with a plan to install a true roof and windows in all historic openings.</p>

		For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom	Liebel				
Ann	Powell	x			

Aaron	Bryant	x			
Jill	Dennis	x			
Laura	Penza		x		
John	Bullock				x
Larry	Gibson	x			
Anath	Ranon			x	
Matthew	Mosca		x		
Jim	French		x		
Elizabeth	Nix				x
Kate	Edwards		x		
Monica	Rhodes	x			
	Total	5	4	1	2

8. Cylburn Arboretum Carriage House, 4915 Greenspring Ave (City-owned Property)

Request:	Concept review: Demolition of rear additions and construction of new addition
Petitioner:	Cylburn Arboretum Friends
Staff Presenter:	Lauren Schiszik
Staff Recommendation:	Staff recommends approval of the demolition of the rear additions and rehabilitation of the carriage house, and concept approval of the new addition with final details of the rehabilitation and the addition to be reviewed by CHAP staff; and CHAP staff should be onsite when the foundation holes of the addition are excavated.
Additional Speakers:	Doug Bottner, Lance Decker, Patricia Foster, Rebecca Henry
Motion made by:	Ranon
Seconded by:	Penza
Motion:	Approve staff recommendation

		For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom	Liebel				
Ann	Powell	x			
Aaron	Bryant	x			
Jill	Dennis	x			
Laura	Penza	x			
John	Bullock				x
Larry	Gibson	x			
Anath	Ranon	x			
Matthew	Mosca	x			
Jim	French	x			
Elizabeth	Nix				x
Kate	Edwards	x			
Monica	Rhodes	x			
	Total				

9. 2039 Clipper Park Road – Tractor Building

Request:	Concept Review: Incorporate Tractor Building into a mixed-use structure
Petitioner:	Valstone Properties
Staff Presenter:	Eric Holcomb
Staff Recommendation:	<p>Three Options:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Disapproval because it does not conform to the guidelines 1.18, 2.1, 2.3, and 2.4 mostly because of the substantial removal of historic features. 2. Approval of Concept Review because the proposal is “without substantial detriment to the public welfare and without substantial derogation of the intents and purposes of this article [Six of the City Code]; and denial of an authorization to proceed would result in substantial hardship to the applicant.” 3. Table the motion and request more information in order to analyze the project in greater detail.
Additional Speakers:	John Larin, Marty Marren, Larry Jennings, Councilman Pinkett, Jarrod , Jessica Maier, Johns Hopkins, Paul Herrera, Norbert , Alana Smith, Charles Alexander, Alisa Brown, Sherry Higgins, Charles Robinson, Ruth Reinheim
Motion made by:	Gibson

Seconded by:	Edwards
Motion:	Approve staff recommendation #2, Approval of Concept Review because the proposal is “without substantial detriment to the public welfare and without substantial derogation of the intents and purposes of this article [Six of the City Code]; and denial of an authorization to proceed would result in substantial hardship to the applicant.”

Tom	Liebel
Ann	Powell
Aaron	Bryant
Jill	Dennis
Laura	Penza
John	Bullock
Larry	Gibson
Anath	Ranon
Matthew	Mosca
Jim	French
Elizabeth	Nix
Kate	Edwards
Monica	Rhodes
	Total

For	Against	Abstain	Absent
	x		
x			
			x
x			
			x
x			
	x		
x			
			x
x			
x			
6	2		

Meeting Adjourned – 6:55 PM