

Staff Report- March 12, 2013
713 Brinkwood Road
Baltimore City Historic District- Hunting Ridge

Plan: Replace tree damaged wood windows on front sunporch with metal clad windows

Staff Presenter: Stacy Montgomery

Applicant: William Haas and Marjorie Gold

Background

The property under review is located within the Hunting Ridge Historic District. The Hunting Ridge Historic District is located at the west end of Baltimore City, and contains a wide variety of 20th century housing styles including Colonial Revival, Tudor Revival, Craftsman Bungalows, French Eclectic, and Modern Styles. Houses in the district were constructed over much of the 20th century; the earliest homes in the development were constructed in the 1920s. The home at 713 Brinkwood Road was constructed in the 1920s and is an American Foursquare with Craftsman detailing. The front façade featured an open porch and enclosed sunporch, which was typical of homes constructed in the neighborhood at that time.

In the late summer of 2012, the sunporch on the front of the home at 713 Brinkwood Road was destroyed when a tree fell on the porch during a storm. The applicant came to CHAP to rebuild the porch and was granted a Notice to Proceed to rebuild to match the original porch. The applicant since requested that the application be amended to allow for metal clad windows in place of the original wood casement windows on the front porch.

This project was reviewed by staff in accordance with CHAP Guidelines 8.6 Windows. Staff also applied the Secretary of the Interior's Standard #6. The staff determined that the proposed metal clad windows did not meet CHAP Guidelines and recommended that the applicant install the approved wood casement windows. The applicant has elected to appeal the staff's decision to the full Commission. The applicant is seeking approval for the installation of metal clad windows on the front porch of the house.

Plan

Per the applicant's request, the plan is to install Jeld-Wen metal clad casement windows on the sunporch on the front of the house to match the size and configuration of the historic wood casement windows. The applicant would like to install metal clad windows for ease of maintenance.

Analysis

The plan as proposed does not meet CHAP Guidelines 8.6 Windows or Standard #6.

CHAP Guidelines 8.6 State the following:

“Do not cover historic window frames, sills or trim with metal or vinyl siding.”

“Use physical, photographic, or historical evidence to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters or blinds. Reconstruct elements with materials to match the original, or, if that is not possible, with a compatible material.”

“Where windows are deteriorated beyond repair, replacement windows shall match the historic window in size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail.”

“Where both window sash and frames are being replaced, pre-manufactured windows of the required size and configuration may be permitted. Match size, type, configuration, material, form, and overall appearance of original windows including frames, sashes and muntins.”

Standard 6 states “Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.”

The historic windows on the sunporch were wood and wood casement windows to match are available. The sunporch is located on the front of the house and therefore has a high level of visibility. In this case, CHAP’s window Guidelines have been applied strictly. Per the Guidelines, the windows should be replaced to match the historic wood windows.

Neighborhood Comments

Hunting Ridge does not currently have an architectural review committee.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends disapproval of the plan as the plan does not meet CHAP Guidelines 8.6 Windows-Window Replacement or Standards #6. Staff recommends that the applicant install wood windows on the reconstructed sunporch.

Site Plan



View Facing North



View Facing South



View Facing East



View Facing West



Existing Brinkwood Road Elevation Showing Damage to Sunporch



Brinkwood Road Elevation Prior to Storm Damage

